The Sūtra of the Wheel of Dharma

Dharmacakrasūtra
chos kyi ’khor lo’i mdo
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CONTENTS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>ti.</strong>  Title</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>co.</strong>  Contents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>s.</strong>   Summary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>ac.</strong>  Acknowledgements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>i.</strong>   Introduction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>tr.</strong>  The Translation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>n.</strong>   Notes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>b.</strong>   Bibliography</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>g.</strong>   Glossary</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
SUMMARY

s.1 *The Sūtra of the Wheel of Dharma* contains the Buddha’s teaching to his five former spiritual companions on the four truths that he had discovered as part of his awakening: (1) suffering, (2) the origin of suffering, (3) the cessation of suffering, and (4) the path leading to the cessation of suffering. According to all the Buddhist traditions, this is the first teaching the Buddha gave to explain his awakened insight to others.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

ac.1 This sūtra was translated and introduced by the Dharmachakra Translation Committee under the guidance of Chökyi Nyima Rinpoche.

The translation was completed under the patronage and supervision of 84000: Translating the Words of the Buddha.
INTRODUCTION

i. 1. The Sūtra of the Wheel of Dharma contains one of the most well-known teachings of Buddhism: the four truths of the noble ones. These four truths are: (1) the truth of suffering, (2) the truth of the origin of suffering, (3) the truth of the cessation of suffering, and (4) the truth of the path leading to the cessation of suffering. According to traditional accounts, this is the first teaching taught by the Buddha following his attainment of awakening. The Buddha is said to have journeyed from the seat of awakening in Bodhgaya to the Deer Park outside Varanasi, where he delivered this teaching to his five former spiritual companions. Since this was the first time the Buddha turned the wheel of Dharma, this discourse also became known as The Sūtra of the Wheel of Dharma, or, more commonly, The Sūtra of the Turning of the Wheel of Dharma.

i. 2. Although very brief, this classical presentation of the four truths has remained central to the Buddhist tradition since its very early days. As such, this teaching is included in all the major canons of Buddhism, so that versions in Pali, Sanskrit, Chinese and Tibetan are found. As far as translations into Tibetan are concerned, we find the classical presentation of the four truths embedded in no fewer than five individual works in the Kangyur. Of these, the following three contain accounts of this first teaching in passages that are clearly closely related, being almost verbatim identical:

- The Chapter on Schism in the Sangha (Saṅghahabhedavastu). This very long text forms the 17th chapter of the Mūlasarvāstivādin vinaya scripture Chapters on Monastic Discipline (Vinayavastu, Toh 1), and includes, interspersed with all sorts of other material, passages recounting the life and deeds of the Buddha.

- The Sūtra on Going Forth (Abhinīśkramanayasūtra, Toh 301). In this text all the passages in The Chapter on Schism in the Sangha recounting the Buddha’s life have been extracted verbatim to form a continuous narrative, including the passage on this teaching.
The Sūtra of the Wheel of Dharma (Dharmacakraśūtra, Toh 337). This text is also a verbatim extract from the account of the teaching as found in Toh 1, but this time only of this particular episode. However, it does add a brief introduction and conclusion to give to the account the form of an independent sūtra.

In addition, the Kangyur also contains a translation of the Dhamma-chakkappavattana sutta from the Pali canon:

The Sūtra of the Turning of the Wheel of Dharma (Dharmacakrapravartanasūtra, Toh 31). This is one of only fourteen texts in the Kangyur that were translated into Tibetan from the Pali. As such it mirrors closely the Dhamma-chakkappavattanasutta of the Saṃyuttanikāya, although some differences exist.5

Lastly, the teaching is also found as part of the Lalita vistara sūtra:

The Play in Full (Lalitavistara, Toh 95). In this lengthy account of the Buddha’s deeds the teaching on the four truths has many similarities with the other texts, yet clearly belongs to another manuscript tradition as there are a number of significant differences as well. Here the teaching is found in the penultimate chapter (ch. 26), entitled “Turning the Wheel of Dharma.”6

In general, the plethora of versions that exist of this teaching in Pali, Sanskrit, Chinese, and Tibetan are very similar, yet all of them contain a number of idiosyncrasies—some minor, others significant—that set them apart from the rest. These differences have been studied in great detail over the last two centuries and a rich body of scholarship on the philological and theoretical aspects of this teaching has emerged.7 As a result, we now know that the teaching on the four truths as we today find it included in the various canons is the product of several editorial revisions over the centuries. As such, the “original” version of this teaching remains elusive, as does the role played by this teaching in the earliest days of the Buddhist tradition.8

As these scriptures became the focus of scholarly attention, a number of translations both from the Pali9 and Sanskrit10 have been produced. The translation presented here has been made on the basis of the Tibetan translation of The Sūtra of the Wheel of Dharma (Toh 337). As mentioned above, this text is with minor exceptions identical to the corresponding sections in Toh 1 and Toh 331. Toh 337 contains no mention of the translators, but the translator of Toh 1 is listed as the Tibetan Kawa Paltseg (ka ba dpal brtsegs), who was a prolific translator during the early period of Tibetan translations, which took place at the beginning of the ninth century. Unfortunately, the Sanskrit version that formed the basis for Kawa Paltseg’s translation of Toh 1 is no longer extant. The Sanskrit manuscript of the Saṅghabhedavāstu that is available to us today (Gnoli 1977) has enough differences from the Tibetan translation for us to conclude that it was not the text that was used to produce the Tibetan translation. Nevertheless, it does
represent an important witness of the Sanskrit, and our translation benefitted greatly from comparing it with the Tibetan. Our main sources were the Degé prints of Toh 1, Toh 301, and Toh 337, taking into account the variants noted in the Pedurma comparative edition of each.
THE TRANSLATION

The Sūtra of the Wheel of Dharma

1.1 [F.275.a] Homage to the Omniscient One!

1.2 Thus did I hear at one time. The Blessed One, the Buddha, was residing in the Deer Park at Ṛṣivadana by Vārāṇasī. At\textsuperscript{11} that time the Blessed One spoke to the group of five monks:\textsuperscript{12}

1.3 “Monks, as I\textsuperscript{13} focused my mind correctly on the things\textsuperscript{14} that I had not hitherto heard, [F.275.b] thinking, ‘This is suffering, a truth of noble beings,’ vision arose; knowledge, apprehension, understanding, and realization\textsuperscript{15} arose.

1.4 “Monks, as I focused my mind correctly on the things that I had not hitherto heard, thinking, ‘This is the origin of suffering, this is the cessation of suffering, and this is the path leading to the cessation of suffering,’ vision arose; knowledge, apprehension, understanding, and realization arose.

1.5 “Monks, as I focused my mind correctly on the things that I had not hitherto heard, thinking, ‘With higher knowledge I should comprehend suffering, that truth of noble beings,’ vision arose; knowledge, apprehension, understanding, and realization arose.

1.6 “Monks, as I focused my mind correctly on the things that I had not hitherto heard, thinking, ‘With higher knowledge I should relinquish the origin of suffering, that truth of noble beings,’ vision arose; knowledge, apprehension, understanding, and realization arose.

1.7 “Monks, as I focused my mind correctly on the things that I had not hitherto heard, thinking, ‘With higher knowledge I should actualize\textsuperscript{17} the cessation of suffering, that truth of noble beings,’ vision arose; knowledge, apprehension, understanding, and realization arose.

1.8 “Monks, as I focused my mind correctly on the things that I had not hitherto heard, thinking, ‘With higher knowledge I should cultivate the path leading to the cessation of suffering, that truth of noble beings,’ vision arose; knowledge,
apprehension, understanding, and realization arose.

“Monks, as I focused my mind correctly on the things that I had not hitherto heard, thinking, ‘With higher knowledge I have comprehended suffering, that truth of noble beings,’ vision arose; knowledge, apprehension, understanding, and realization arose.

“Monks, as I focused my mind correctly on the things that I had not hitherto heard, thinking, ‘With higher knowledge I have relinquished the origin of suffering, that truth of noble beings,’ vision arose; knowledge, apprehension, understanding, and realization arose.

“Monks, as I focused my mind correctly on the things that I had not hitherto heard, thinking, ‘With higher knowledge I have actualized the cessation of suffering, that truth of noble beings,’ vision arose; knowledge, apprehension, understanding, and realization arose.

“Monks, as I focused my mind correctly on the things that I had not hitherto heard, thinking, ‘With higher knowledge I have cultivated the path leading to the cessation of suffering, that truth of noble beings,’ vision arose; knowledge, apprehension, understanding, and realization arose.

“Monks, until I had achieved the vision, knowledge, apprehension, understanding, and realization of these four truths of noble beings that are turned in three phases and comprise twelve aspects, I had not been freed from the world replete with gods, māras, Brahmā, mendicants, brahmins, humans, and gods. I had not escaped from it, severed ties with it, or been delivered from it. Nor did I dwell extensively with a mind free from error. Monks, I did not have the knowledge that I had fully awakened to unsurpassed and perfect buddhahood.

“Monks, once I had achieved the vision, knowledge, apprehension, understanding, and realization of turning these four truths of noble beings in three phases with twelve aspects, I was freed from the world replete with gods, māras, Brahmā, mendicants, brahmins, humans, and gods. I had escaped from it, severed ties with it, and been delivered from it. I dwelled extensively with a mind free from error. [F.276.b] Monks, I then had the knowledge that I had fully awakened to unsurpassed and perfect buddhahood.”

When the Blessed One had given this Dharma discourse, venerable Kauṇḍinya, along with eighty thousand gods, achieved the Dharma vision that is free from dust and stainless with regard to phenomena.

The Blessed One now asked venerable Kauṇḍinya, “Kauṇḍinya, did you understand the Dharma?”

“Blessed One,” he replied, “I understood.”

“Kauṇḍinya, did you understand? Did you understand?”

“Blissful One,” he replied, “I understood. I understood.”
“Because venerable Kauṇḍinya has understood the Dharma, venerable Kauṇḍinya shall now be known as Ājñātakaũṇḍinya.”

At that point the terrestrial yakṣas called out, “Venerable Kauṇḍinya has understood the Dharma!” And they continued, “Friends, in the Deer Park at Ṛṣivadana by Vārāṇasī, the Blessed One has turned the wheel of Dharma in three phases with twelve aspects. He has turned the wheel of Dharma in a way that no mendicant or brahmin, and no god, māra, or Brahmā in the world could ever do in accord with the Dharma. He has done so for the benefit of many beings, for the happiness of many beings, out of love for the world, and for the welfare, benefit, and happiness of gods and humans. Hence, the gods will flourish and the demigods will be on the wane.”

As the voices of the terrestrial yakṣas rang out—at that very moment, in that very instant, and at that very time—the news passed to the celestial yakṣas, as well as to the gods in the Heaven of the Four Great Kings, the Heaven of the Thirty-Three, the Heaven Free from Strife, the Heaven of Joy, the Heaven of Delighting in Emanations, the Heaven of Making Use of Others’ Emanations, and all the way to the Brahmā realm. Thus, also the gods in the Brahmā realm announced, “Friends, in the Deer Park at Ṛṣivadana by Vārāṇasī, the Blessed One has turned the wheel of Dharma in three phases with twelve aspects. He has turned the wheel of Dharma in a way that no mendicant or brahmin, and no god, māra, or Brahmā in the world could ever do in accord with the Dharma. He has done so for the benefit of many beings, for the happiness of many beings, out of love for the world, and for the welfare, benefit, and happiness of gods and humans. Hence, the gods will flourish and the demigods will be on the wane.”

In the Deer Park at Ṛṣivadana by Vārāṇasī, the Blessed One turned the wheel of Dharma in three phases with twelve aspects. Therefore, this Dharma teaching was named Turning the Wheel of Dharma.

This completes “The Sūtra of the Wheel of Dharma.”
NOTES

1. For a summary of the Pali, Sanskrit, and Chinese sources of this teaching, see Anderson 1999, p. 15-16. See also Bronkhorst 1993, p. 80, n. 200.

2. Although the precise historical relationship between these three texts has not been fully confirmed, it is highly likely that Toh 1 is the source, from which Toh 301 is an extract relating the Buddha’s life as a whole (naturally including this episode), while Toh 337 is a very short extract of this episode alone.

3. The section corresponding to the present sūtra is found in ‘dul ba, nga, folios 42b.3-44a.5

4. The corresponding section is found in mdo sde, sa, 60a.1-61b.3

5. This text is found in the Degé Kangyur, vol. 34 (shes phyin, ka), folios 180b.1-183a.6, in the section of “Thirteen Late Translated Texts.” This group of works is traditionally placed in the Perfection of Wisdom section but is not, in fact, related to that genre. The texts were translated from Pali in the fourteenth century at the monastery of Tharpa Ling by a Sri Lankan monk, Ānandaśrī, and the Tibetan translator Nyima Gyaltsen Pel Zangpo. According to Skilling (1993, p. 97), this was during the first decade of the fourteenth century; Skilling has compared this particular text against the extant Pali Dhammachakkappavattanasutta (1993, pp. 103-106), and concludes that the Tibetan follows the Pali version but contains some significant omissions that he attributes to an erroneous manuscript or translation errors.

6. The relevant section is found in Degé Kangyur, vol. 46 (mdo sde, kha), folios 200b.1-201a.4. For the translation, see Dharmachakra Translation Committee (2013), 26.60 - 26.78 (http://read.84000.co/translation/UT22084-046-001.html#UT22084-046-001-2121).

7. For a summary of modern scholarship on the four truths, see Anderson 1999, pp. 168-211.

8. See Bronkhorst 1993, pp. 71-85. See also Anderson 1999, pp. 15-23.


The equivalent section in Toh 1 begins at this point (p. 42b.3) and in Toh 301 (p. 60a.1).

At this point, the corresponding passage in the Lalitavistarasūtra begins (Lefmann, p. 417; Dharmachakra Translation Group, 26.65).

The Sanskrit of the Saṅghabhedavastu does not include the first person personal pronoun in this first paragraph, although it does in the subsequent paragraphs (Gnoli 1977, p. 135). However, the Tibetan does include the first person personal pronoun throughout, including in this first paragraph. This is also the case with the Sanskrit of the Lalitavistarasūtra (Lefmann, p. 417) and the Pali Dhammacakkappavattanasutta (Saṃyutta Nikāya, 56.11; see also Anderson 1999, p. 18).

Here “things” translates the Sanskrit dharma (Pali: dhamma, Tibetan: chos). The commentaries suggest that dharma is used here in the sense of “truth.” For example, the Puggalapaññāttipakaraṇa-mūlaṭīkā says: ananussutesu dhammesūti ca ananussutesu saccessūti attho. http://www.tipitaka.org/romn/cscd/abh03t.tik1.xml).

The Saṅghabhedavastu does not include “realization” (Tibetan: rtogs pa) in this or the following several repetitions of this phrase. Instead the list only includes “knowledge (jñāna), apprehension (vidyā), and understanding (buddhi)” (Gnoli 1977, p. 135).

Before the phrase “This is the origin of suffering,” Toh 337 in the Degé Kangyur includes the phrase “This is suffering.” However, here we have omitted it, as it is absent in all other versions of this passage, including the recensions of this sūtra in the Yongle, Lithang, Coné, Narthang, and Peking Kangyurs; the Sanskrit of the Saṅghabhedavastu; and the Tibetan of both Toh 1 and Toh 301 in D and other Kangyurs.

At this point Toh 337 includes the words “the knowledge of…” However, we have omitted this, since the phrase is absent in Toh 1 and Toh 301, as well as the Saṅghabhedavastu.

At this point Toh 337 includes the words “the knowledge of…” However, we have omitted this, since the phrase is absent in Toh 1 and Toh 301, as well as the Saṅghabhedavastu.

The three phases refer to the three stages of (1) identifying the four truths, (2) understanding how to relate to each of the four truths, and (3) knowing that the respective goals of the four truths have been accomplished. When these three stages are applied to each of the four truths, there are twelve aspects in all. For a classical explanation of this enumeration by Haribhadra (eighth cent.), see Sparham 2008, p. 264. See also Anderson 1999, p. 70. Note that these twelve
aspects are unrelated to the alternative enumeration of sixteen aspects associated with the four truths (four for each truth). The sixteen aspects counteract sixteen incorrect views associated with the four truths. On the sixteen aspects, see Buswell 2013, p. 304-305. For a classical account by Candrakīrti (c. 570-650 CE), see May 1959, p. 212-216.

At this point, the corresponding passage in the Lalitavistarasūtra ends (Lefmann, p. 418).

This name means “Kauṇḍinya who has understood.”

Toh 1 (p. 44a.5) and Toh 301 (p. 61b.3) end at this point.
chos kyi ‘khor lo’i mdo. Toh 337, Degé Kangyur, vol. 72 (mdo sde, sa), folios 275a-277a.


GLOSSARY

1. Ājñātakaṇḍinya
   *kun shes kauN Di nya*
   
   Ājñātakaṇḍinya
   Another name for Kaṇḍinya. As he was the first to understand the Buddha’s teaching on the four truths, he received the name Ājñātakaṇḍinya (“Kaṇḍinya who understood”).

2. Brahmā
   *tshangs pa*
   
   Brahmā
   A high ranking deity, presiding over a divine world where other beings consider him the creator; he is also considered to be the “Lord of the Sāhā-world (our universe).”

3. Brahmā realm
   *tshangs ris*
   
   brahmakāyika
   The lowest heaven of the form realm.

4. Deer Park
   *ri dags kyi nags*
   
   mṛgadāva
   The forest, located outside of Varanasi, where the Buddha first taught the Dharma.

5. Demigod
   *lha ma yin*
   
   asura
   The traditional adversaries of the devas (gods) who are frequently portrayed in Brahmical mythology as having a disruptive effect on cosmological and social harmony.

6. Heaven Free from Strife
   *'thab bral*
   
   g.1
   g.2
   g.3
   g.4
   g.5
   g.6
Yāma
The third lowest of the six heavens of the desire realm.

Heaven of Delighting in Emanations

Heaven of Joy

dga’ ldan

Tuṣita
The third highest of the six heavens of the desire realm.

Heaven of Making Use of Others’ Emanations

gzhan ‘phrul dbang byed pa

Paranirmitavasāvartin
The highest of the six heavens of the desire realm.

Heaven of the Four Great Kings

rgyal chen bzhi’i ris

Caturnahārāṇīka
The lowest of the six heavens of the desire realm.

Heaven of the Thirty-Three

sum cu rtsa gsum

Trāyastriṃśa
The second lowest of the six heavens of the desire realm.

Kauṇḍinya

Kauṇḍinya
One of the five former spiritual friends with whom Gautama had practiced meditation before his awakening.

Ṛṣivadana

drang srong smra ba

Rśivadana
A sacred area located outside of Vārāṇasī where many sages are said to have practiced in the past.

Truth of noble beings

‘phags pa’i bden pa
āryasatya

The four truths that the Buddha realized: suffering, origin, cessation, and path. They are named “truths of noble beings” since only “noble beings” with knowledge of reality can understand them.

g.15 Vārāṇasī

bA rA Na sl

Vārāṇasī

City in North India where the Buddha first taught the Dharma

g.16 Yakṣa

gnod sbyin

yakṣa

A class of semidivine beings said to dwell in the north, under the jurisdiction of the Great King Vaiśravaṇa, otherwise known as Kubera.